Fragile trophy markets: Sustainable hunting practices and community benefits are the key factors for the EU and CITES

Dr. Heli Siitari
International Council for Game and Wildlife Conservation
2nd October 2016
CIC Vision & Mission

Vision
A world that values and supports sustainable hunting for the benefit of people and nature.

Mission
To promote - across the globe – sustainable hunting to conserve wildlife and wild lands, support communities and preserve our hunting heritage.
The Four Global Initiatives

- Combat Wildlife Crime
- Promote Wildlife Conservation
- Partner with International Organizations
- Sustain our Cultural Heritage
Combat Wildlife Crime

- Fight against wildlife crime is one of CIC’s top priorities

- Illegal wildlife use and trafficking threaten wildlife populations
  - Impacts livelihood of rural communities

- CIC advocates sustained resolve and collaboration among nations
  - Building of national wildlife law enforcement capacity and strategic communication
  - Joint efforts by hunting and conservation groups
  - Strengthening of international organizations such as CITES, CBD, CMS, ICCWC and TRAFFIC
Partner with International Organizations

- CIC has a long tradition of partnership with many international organizations

- CIC is a founding member of the Collaborative Partnership on Sustainable Wildlife Management (CPW). This partnership unites CIC with
  - CBD, CIFOR, CITES, CMS, IUCN, UNEP, IUFRO, FAO, ITC, TRAFFIC, IIFB & OIE
  - All have mandates to cooperate with public and private partners to promote the conservation and sustainable use of terrestrial vertebrate wildlife in all biomes and geographic areas
Sustain our Global Cultural Heritage

- Hunting constitutes arguably the oldest human activity
  - Strong influence on human development, religion and social interaction from the beginnings of human history

- Few human activities, other than hunting, offer a more sustained link across human civilizations, from the Stone Age to the Internet Age

→ This rich and diverse human heritage needs to be appropriately recognized and sustained
Promote Wildlife Conservation

- Worldwide, the ecological balance is under threat through human development
- Expansive wild landscapes needed for the survival of entire ecosystems and their wildlife
- Responsible and sustainable hunting practices constitute an important conservation tool for incentive-driven conservation
The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) regulates international trade (export, re-export and import) of hunting trophies of species listed in its Appendices I and II.
CITES Appendices:

Appendices I, II, and III to the Convention are lists of species afforded different levels or types of protection from over-exploitation.
Appendix I: For most strictly protected species, the most endangered among CITES-listed animals

Appendix II: List of species which are not necessarily now threatened with extinction but may become so unless trade is closely controlled, or a ”look-alike species”

Appendix III: List of species that needs collaboration to prevent unsustainable use or illegal exploitation
CITES Appendix I:

- Includes species that are threatened to extinction
- Trade strictly regulated, only in exceptional circumstances (for non-primarily commercial purposes)
- Trophy exports hunted for a fee is allowed with strict regulations (non-commercial, sale or other commercial use after imported is prohibited)
CITES Appendix I:

- Before export:
  - Scientific establishment that the trade is not detrimental to the species survival (sustainable trade)
  - Legality of the specimen have to be confirmed (in accordance with the legislation of the exporting country)
  - Trade subject to both export and import permit
CITES Appendix II:

- List of species not necessarily now threatened but may become so
- Trade allowed for commercial purposes (both export and import)
- **But:** Scientific establishment that the trade is not detrimental to the species survival (sustainable trade) (like app. I species)
- **And:** Legality of the specimen have to be confirmed (in accordance with the legislation of the exporting country) (like App. I species)
- **NEW:** Export permit needed!
The EU becomes a party to CITES

The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora
European Union

• Joined CITES in 2015, when regional economic integration organization, like EU, were allowed to join CITES

• All member states (28) were CITES members already before this

• EU accession will reinforce visibility and accountability of the EU as it will be speaking at CITES CoPs on issues of EU competence

• Still 28 votes in CITES CoP
EU Appendices A-D

• **Annex A includes:**
  • All CITES Appendix I species, except where EU Member States have entered a reservation
  • Some CITES Appendix II and III species, for which the EU has adopted stricter domestic measures
  • Some non-CITES species

• **Annex B includes:**
  • All other CITES Appendix II species, except where EU Member States have entered a reservation
  • Some CITES Appendix III species
  • Some non-CITES species
EU Appendices A-D

• **Annex C includes:**
  • All other CITES Appendix III species, except where EU Member States have entered a reservation

• **Annex D includes:**
  • Some CITES Appendix III species for which the EU holds a reservation
  • Some non-CITES species in order to be consistent with other EU regulations on the protection of native species, such as the [Habitats Directive](https://ec.europa.eu/environment/nature/habitatsdirective/index_en.html) and the [Birds Directive](https://ec.europa.eu/environment/nature/birdsdirective/index_en.html)
Trophy hunting and politics

- Under more pressure especially in EU and USA
- Restrictions beyond what is required under CITES were adopted, e.g. bans for trophies
- European parliament has tried to ban trophy imports recently, no success so far
- -> European Commission new list of restrictions and requirements were represented in CITES CoP
- -> New Resolution for hunting trophies was adopted
Trophy hunting (TH)

- Well-managed and sustainable TH is consistent with and contributes to species conservation, as it provides both livelihood opportunities for rural communities and incentives for habitat conservation, and generates benefits which can be invested for conservation purposes.
Trophy hunting (TH):

Resolution Conf. 16.6 on CITES and livelihoods recognizes that

• rural communities may attach economic, social, cultural and ceremonial importance to some CITES-listed species, and that the resources that trophy hunting provides to certain local communities

• range states invest significant resources on science and establishment of sustainable quotas for hunting trophies
The CoP17

1) AGREES that the export of hunting trophies listed in Appendix I or II should be conditional upon issuance of an export permit in accordance with Art. III or IV of the Convention

2) URGES exporting countries to only authorize the export of hunting trophies of species listed in Appendix I or II when the following conditions are met:
Conditions required for app. I or II species export permits:

a) A management Authority of the state of export is satisfied that the specimen was not obtained in contravention of the laws of that country for the protection of fauna;

b) in reviewing trade in hunting trophies, a Management Authority of the State of export is satisfied that the said specimen conforms to the definition of hunting trophy as contained in Resolution Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP16) on Permits and Certificates, and corresponds therefore to a whole animal, or a readily recognizable part or derivative of an animal, specified on the accompanying CITES permit or certificate, that:

– i. is raw, processed or manufactured;

– ii. was legally obtained by the hunter through hunting for the hunter's personal use; and

– iii. is being imported, exported or re-exported by or on behalf of the hunter, as part of the transfer from its country of origin, the hunter's State of usual residence;
Conditions required for app. I or II species export permits:

C)

A Scientific Authority of the State of export takes into account the concepts and nonbinding guiding principles contained in Resolution Conf. 16.7 on Non-detriment findings in determining whether the export of the hunting trophy would be detrimental to the survival of the species, which may include:

- i. information relating to distribution, status and trends of populations based on national conservation plans, where applicable, and informs harvest;
- ii. a review of the sustainability of harvest levels, taking account all mortality sources affecting the wild population of the species, including mortality due to illegal killing.
4) (should be 3!) RECOMMENDS that Parties exporting hunting trophies of CITES-listed species ensure that trophy hunting is sustainably managed, does not undermine the conservation of target species and, as appropriate, provides benefits to local communities by having in place a) a robust regulatory framework relating to the harvesting of trophies, b) an effective enforcement mechanism with adequate deterrents in the form of penalties for non-compliance, c) a monitoring system designed to effectively monitor population trends and status, and d) an adaptive management system through which harvest levels can be adjusted according to the needs of the specific population and based on the results of the monitoring programme;
5) FURTHER RECOMMENDS that trophy hunting activities relating to species listed in Appendix I should produce conservation benefits for the species concerned and thus may benefit from having a benefit sharing or incentive system in place to ensure that harvesting contributes to the offsetting of the costs of living with certain species such as elephants.
The CoP resolution

6) URGES Parties trading in hunting trophies to apply the Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports in order to assess adherence to quotas and compliance with the provisions of the Convention.

7) RECOMMENDS that importing and exporting countries maintain a close dialogue as necessary, and that these countries share information, upon request, regarding the finding of the Scientific Authorities.
8) FURTHER RECOMMENDS that Parties consider the contribution of hunting to species conservation and socio-economic benefits, and its role in providing incentives for people to conserve wildlife, when considering stricter domestic measures and making decisions relating to the import of hunting trophies.

9) FURTHER RECOMMENDS that Parties make every reasonable effort to consult range States of the species concerned prior to the adoption of stricter measures relating to trade in hunting trophies, as recommended in Resolution Conf. 6.7 on Interpretation of Article XIV, paragraph 1, of the Convention.
Conclusions:

• No way back  – but instead

BE PRO-ACTIVE whenever possible!
Possible further recommendations:

• For Markhor trophy hunting:
• **Prove clearly** that the conditions of the CoP17 Resolution are met (population numbers and trends, national conservation program in place, regular review on nrs of offtake, poaching, sustainability etc)
• **Benefits for the rural people and conservation** benefits for the species VERY important!
Possible further recommendations:

CoP based quota for Markhor (like Pakistan)?


Avantage: CoP approved quota can hardly be refused by importing countries!
Thank you for your attention!